DEVELOPING AN EQUITY SCORECARD FOR YOUR COLLEGE

Terri Manning and Leon Hill
Strategic Data and Technology Coaches
Achieving the Dream
We will explore:

The differences between equity and equality.
The difference between a scorecard and a dashboard and the implications of each.
A process to determine key metrics and equity groups for your college.
Options for managing a scorecard and those implications.
WHAT IS EQUITY?

Based in Fairness and Justice
WHY EQUITY AND WHY NOW?

• Equity is not new. It is the new standard for what it means to be a competent educator.

• Equality means we treat all students equally. We give them all the same treatment, thus believing we are giving them an equal chance to succeed.

• Equity means we give students what they need so that they have an equal chance of success. Some need more than others.
**Equality** = everyone is treated the same ... as in all (men) are created equal..... Equality sets up the powerful expectation that everyone deserves the same opportunity to influence the course of their lives, and to benefit from the fruits of a good society.

**Equity** = everyone has different needs and requirements and should be treated accordingly. It takes into account the idea of quality or ideal treatment – of being just, impartial, and fair. In order for students to have an equal opportunity and the potential to obtain equal benefits in life, they need additional help or assistance at the beginning or at some point along the way.
It upsets people that we select out certain groups and give them “preferential treatment.” Is that what we are really doing?

We already do this with developmental education and disabilities services. Those faculty/staff are trained to work with students who have developmental delays and learning difficulties.

We understand that these students need extra help to have as “equal” a chance of success as other students. Without help, they will not succeed. But who else needs focused services?
I am a parent of three children. During elementary school, two of those children do very well in school. The third has great difficulty with math and reading.

To treat them with “equality,” I would spend the same amount of time and energy on homework with each child.

To treat them “equitably,” I would give the two children doing well in school the time and energy it takes for them to continue doing well. I would get a tutor for the third child, spend extra time with his teacher discussing ways to help him and spend many more hours helping him learn and complete his homework. I am trying to improve his skills so he has an equal chance of success as do my other two children.
Equity is difficult because we don’t always know what certain groups of students need. It is based in fairness and inclusion.
In the first image, it is assumed that everyone will benefit from the same supports. They are being treated equally.
EQUALITY VERSUS EQUITY

In the first image, it is assumed that everyone will benefit from the same supports. They are being treated equally.

In the second image, individuals are given different supports to make it possible for them to have equal access to the game. They are being treated equitably.
EQUALITY VERSUS EQUITY

In the first image, it is assumed that everyone will benefit from the same supports. They are being treated equally.

In the second image, individuals are given different supports to make it possible for them to have equal access to the game. They are being treated equitably.

In the third image, all three can see the game without any supports or accommodations because the cause of the inequity was addressed. The systemic barrier has been removed.
Why is equity important at your college?
Community colleges are an indispensable asset in our nation’s efforts to ensure and preserve access to higher education and success for all students, particularly students of color, low-income students, and other historically underrepresented student populations. However, student access and success in higher education continue to be impacted by the effects of structural racism and systemic poverty. Achievement gaps among student groups reflect structural inequities that are often the result of historic and systemic social injustices. These inequities typically manifest themselves as the unintended or indirect consequences of unexamined institutional or social policies.
HOW DO WE MONITOR OUR EQUITY OUTCOMES/METRICS?
KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

- KPIs evaluate the success of an organization or of a particular activity (such as projects, programs, products and other initiatives) in which it engages.
- They help managers gauge the effectiveness of various functions and processes important to achieving their goals.
- Typically linked to the strategic goals of the college.
- They use both leading and lagging indicators.
  - Lagging tell you how you have done.
  - Leading forecasts what might happen.
- Can be part of a scorecard or dashboard.
Some Colleges Place Their KPIs on a Dashboard
Some Colleges Place Their KPIs on a Scorecard
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Owner</th>
<th>Frequency For Review</th>
<th>January 2013</th>
<th>February 2013</th>
<th>March 2013</th>
<th>YTD FY 2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government &amp; Public Works</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce average call wait time from x to y</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.471</td>
<td>1.278</td>
<td>3.778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce resolution time of complaints from x days to y days</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve average overall customer satisfaction rating to x%</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>83.667%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase the % of employees participating in community service projects from x% to y%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase employee satisfaction rating from x% to y%</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>82.667%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>x% of Training Verification Completed</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce the # of key projects open from x% to y%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of street/road signs not repaired</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Paul Campbell</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Student Composition**

African American Students are 10% of All New Students while Latino Students Comprise About 9%

- **All New Students**
  - Black
  - Hispanic
  - White

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Hispanic</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
<td>726</td>
<td>485</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
<td>733</td>
<td>492</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>721</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>742</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

College's Student Body Closely Reflects the Community It Serves

- Fall 2016
  - Black: 10%
  - Hispanic: 10%
  - White: 79%

- Logan County: 8%
- Laramie County: 10%

- Black: 76%
- Hispanic: 77%
- White: 51%

**Dual Enrollment**

Opportunity Exists to Expand Minority Student Participation in Dual Enrollment

- **Dual Enrollment Participation by Race/Ethnicity**
  - Black: 6.9%
  - Hispanic: 7.1%
  - White: 13.1%

- **Note:** Data presentation has been adjusted proportionally to match the percentage of College students with unknown race and ethnicity data. 9-12 schools are not allowed to report students in an unknown category.

**Developmental Education Referral and Completion**

Proportionately More Minority and Pell Eligible Students are Referred to Developmental Education Which Prolongs Time to Completion

- 5 year Developmental Education Referral Rates
  - White: 53%
  - Black: 70%
  - Hispanic: 72%

  - MATH: 56%
  - ENGLISH: 26%

  - Pell Eligible Ever: 30%
  - Non Pell Eligible Ever: 70%
Concentration in Major Field of Study

More Minority Students are Concentrating in a Major Field of Study But Still Lag White Students

Achievement Gaps have closed for Pell Eligible Students

Career Pathways

Similar to National Trends, College Minority Students Major in Career Areas with Lower Earning Potential

Majors Overrepresented in:

- African American Students:
  - Human Services: +7.9%
  - Culinary: +11.7%
  - Corrections: +10.9%
  - Sports & Fitness: +10.2%
  - Practical Nursing: +14.9%

- Latino Students:
  - Police Science: -7.7%
  - Medical Assisting: +10.7%
  - Human Services: +0.6%
  - Corrections: +36.1%
  - Medical Assisting: +33.1%

Majors Underrepresented in:

- African American Students and Latino Students:
  - Universal Science: -3.5%
  - Computer Info Systems: Software Design: -16.9%

- Pell:
  - Undecided: +87.4%
  - Mechatronic Design: -56.2%

Persistence

College Has Closed Persistence Gaps for Latino Students But No Progress Has Been Made for African American Students

YEAR-TO-YEAR

- Black: 41% to 49%
- Hispanic: 52% to 53%
- White: 62% to 62%

- Pell Eligible Ever: 34% to 35%
- Non-Pell Eligible Ever: 51% to 47%
**DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A DASHBOARD AND A SCORECARD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dashboard</th>
<th>Scorecard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Is used for...</strong></td>
<td>performance measurement / monitoring</td>
<td>performance management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>As a measurement tool is...</strong></td>
<td>metric</td>
<td>KPI (Metric + Target).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measure is linked to college objectives...</strong></td>
<td>doesn’t link</td>
<td>links</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>It measures...</strong></td>
<td>performance</td>
<td>progress (the current value versus the target value)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A DASHBOARD AND A SCORECARD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dashboard</th>
<th>Scorecard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is updated...</td>
<td>in real-time</td>
<td>periodically (each semester or annually)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It focuses on...</td>
<td>operational (short-term) goals</td>
<td>strategic (long-term) goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Its purpose is to...</td>
<td>give a high-level idea of what is happening in the institution</td>
<td>plan and execute a strategy, identify why something is happening and what can be done about that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Its helps...</td>
<td>visualize the performance to understand the current state</td>
<td>align KPIs, objectives, and actions to see the connection between them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In an automobile it is...</td>
<td>automobile dashboard (shows how your car is operating)</td>
<td>GPS (shows when and how you will arrive?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We want to increase the success rates in college-level math (a lagging indicator). What would be leading indicators that pass rates might increase this term?
- Attendance in class is up over last term (fewer absences)
- Participation in the math lab, supplemental instruction and tutoring is up over last term.
- At mid-term, withdrawal rates are 20% lower than last term.
The fundamental thing students must do is pass courses with successful grades (A-C).
- They must pass English and math to move on.
- They must complete the gen ed core.
- They must accumulate credits in their major with passing grades.
- They must return or persist.
- Finally they graduate.
KPIS, DASHBOARDS AND SCORE CARDS

- Can be a teaching tool for the college.
- Will stimulate discussion and action.
- Will let a college know where they have issues that need attention.
- Should point them toward solutions.

Seriously consider what you include as metrics. Include an equity lens with your scorecard.
LET’S SPEND A FEW MINUTES ON STUDENTS WITH INEQUITIES

- This is a hard and courageous conversation to have.
- What are some characteristics or conditions students enter with that create barriers to learning and academic success?
- Faculty say in the first few weeks “this student is going to have trouble in my class.”
- If you had a magic wand, what would you have available to students that you don’t currently have or have enough of?
One College Selected These Groups

- Minority students, in particular, African American and Latino students
- Males, especially minority males
- Low income students (those on Pell)
- Low income students with no financial support from their families (zero EFC)
- Underprepared students who have either low high school GPAs, place into developmental coursework or arrive at the college with GEDs
- Students with disabilities
- Students from high poverty neighborhoods
- Veterans and Dependents of Veterans
If you want to develop an equity score card that was supported and adopted by your college, how would you get started?

Part one in the process is selecting groups with inequities.
SOME SUGGESTIONS

1. Become knowledgeable about equity and the conversations about it in higher education.

2. Select a few concerned and appropriate people to work with you in the beginning.

3. Disaggregate a little data (maybe race, age, gender and Pell status) and create a very brief report.

4. Ask to present it to the senior leadership and educate them about why equity matters.
5. Ask to form an equity committee and begin collecting feedback from faculty, staff and students.

6. Ask about students that need additional help, students that appear to be struggling in class, students that are in and out in the first three weeks. Who has inequities?

7. Create a list of groups to evaluate and consider what data you actually have available to you (1st gen?, family income?).
What are some key metrics and equity groups at your college that you should be assessing?
PART TWO IS HOW TO SELECT METRICS

What would give you the most useful data at your college?
This student just progressed through your college and graduated in four years. If you examined what she did each term and year, what would you find?
HERE IS WHAT YOU WOULD FIND

- She had a goal, was motivated.
- She withdrew from very few courses.
- She consistently took 6-9 credits a term and passed all of them.
- She saw a counselor/advisor regularly.
- She didn’t change majors very many times if at all.
- She made mostly A-C grades.
- She returned each term – persistent.
- She didn’t take very many if any developmental courses.
- She made connections at the college with new/old friends, faculty, staff and program content.
GETTING IT RIGHT MATTERS

- Select the right progression metrics for your college.
- Select the groups who enter with inequities.
- Here is an example.
## Here are Some Progression Metrics

| First Term Measures | 1. Students with a cumulative GPA of 2.0 or greater at the end of their first term;  
|                     | 2. Students who have earned zero credits at the end of the first term (dropped out or failed all courses);  
|                     | 3. Students who complete 80% of the courses they attempt with A-C, P grades;  
|                     | 4. Students who complete 6, 9 and 12 credits in their first term. |
| First Year Measures | 1. Students who return in the spring after their first fall term (fall-to-spring retention);  
|                     | 2. Students who accumulates 12, 18, and 24 credits in their first year;  
|                     | 3. Students who complete College-level math in their first year;  
|                     | 4. Students who complete College-level English in their first year; |
| Second Year Measures| 1. Students who return the next year after their first fall term (fall-to-fall retention);  
|                     | 2. Students who complete 24, 36 and 48 credits by the end of their second year |
WHAT ARE SOME OTHERS?

- Student recruitment numbers
- Faculty diversity numbers (match the student population)
- Number/percent who:
  - declare a major
  - earn 9 credits in the major (just one)
  - number of changes in major
- Percent of total course grades that end in Ws
- Completion metrics – certificates, diplomas, degrees, transfer
- Continued enrollment at the college
1. Back to the drawing board with suggestions and examples. What would tell us the most at this college?
2. Start with a potential list of progression metrics.
3. Pull data and begin compiling your report.
4. Hold an informational event such as a data summit or a gallery walk to present the preliminary data. Get feedback, take suggestions.
5. Remember this is an iterative process.
### The Benefits of Disaggregating Data and Looking at Specific Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Retention Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All students</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time students</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students with 24+ credits</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time students</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New students</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New college-ready students</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple measures students</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students taking all courses online</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental students</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The percentage of new students from fall 2015 who had a grade point average of 2.0 or greater at the end of the first term.

Highest to lowest 45% difference.
The percentage of new students from fall 2015 who had accumulated zero credits at the end of their first term (all Fs or Ws).

Highest to lowest 12% difference.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Associates Degree Completers (4 Years)</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academically and Economically Prepared</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veterans</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Females</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Students</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Males</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All New Students</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latina Females</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino Students</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependents of Veterans</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American Females</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino Males</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students on Pell</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students on Pell with Zero EFC</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Poverty Zip Codes</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Students</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American Students</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students with Disabilities</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American Males</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students with GEDs</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS Grads GPA &lt;2.0</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The percentage of new students from fall 2015 who completed math and English in their first year.

Highest to lowest 28% and 26% difference.
The percentage of new students from fall 2015 who returned from fall to spring and from fall to fall.

Highest to lowest 16% and 27% difference.
ONCE YOU HAVE DATA

• Everything will not be fine!
• Will you post the scorecard and do nothing?
• What’s next (the hardest part)?
DISCUSSION

Discuss something difficult your college did that required everyone’s attention and focus. What were the characteristics of the process that moved it forward?
WHAT WILL YOU SUGGEST TO BEGIN THE DIFFICULT EQUITY WORK AT YOUR COLLEGE?

• Look at best practices.
• Consider a council of advocate.
• Set benchmarks and collect data on your metrics as often as you can (each term or each year).
• Use your data team for more than your ATD work. Institutionalize it with the scorecard being one of its tasks.
• Don’t forget professional development.
How will creating a scorecard and/or dashboard at your college help with equality among all students?
Who needs to be involved?
WE ARE ALL STRIVING FOR.....

Equity in policy and practice that levels the playing field for all students!
Questions
CONTACT INFORMATION

• Terri Manning:
  tmanning@achievingthedream.org

• Leon Hill:

• lhill@achievingthedream.org